



**In association with Euroforum, the Foreign and Commonwealth Office,
Manpower and the Ministry of Employment and Social Affairs,**

Report on Wilton Park Conference WP 890

**MIGRATION: TOWARDS A COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH
at Euroforum, El Escorial, Spain**

Monday 8 – Wednesday 10 October 2007

1. Migration affects every country in the world, and we can expect its importance to grow, impacting on international relations, foreign policy, and the global economy. Today, migrants comprise 4 per cent of the global population. According to the United Nations (UN), between 1960 and 2005, the number of people living away from their country of origin has more than doubled: from 75 to 191 million. Fifty nine per cent live in high-income countries. Since the 1960s, there has been an almost equal distribution across three of the migration routes: north-north - 53 million; south-south - 61 million; and south-north - 62 million. This compares to 14 million migrating from the north to the south. The European Union (EU) currently has the largest number of migrants, making up 33 per cent of its population.

2. A comprehensive approach towards migration needs to take account of both demographic and economic objectives. The UN predicts that the world population will be 9.2 billion by 2050, an increase of 40 per cent since 1950. Most of the growth will take place in the developing world, from 5.4 billion in 2007 to 7.9 billion people in 2050, of which nearly 2 billion will be in Africa. The population of developed countries is expected to remain largely unchanged at 1.2 billion, and would in fact decline if not for the projected net migration from developing to developed countries, expected to average 2.3 million people per year after 2010. At the same time, the current

population is ageing. By 2025, for every one person in the developed world, there will be five people in the developing world between the ages of 15 and 39. Migration can, therefore, offset population ageing in some countries. In order to maintain their current population stock of 15-64 year olds, Japan would have to import 600,000 young immigrants every year, Germany 400,000 and the United States 350,000.

3. Definitions and labels related to migration are not always consistently understood and applied. Migration itself is a dynamic process and the final outcome is not always known at the start of the process. Countries are not simply 'sending', 'transit', or 'destination' countries, but can be, and often are, all three: as a developing country tries to cope with the emigration of many of its young people, it may also be hosting a number of refugees from a neighbouring state. Migration can also be circular with temporary migration ending in return to the originating country. In other cases, individuals may spend part of the year in the destination country and part of the year in the originating country. Both scenarios can ultimately have positive results, in terms of skills transfer and economic investment back into the country of origin.

4. Migration develops over time and our conception of it is always changing. During the Cold War, governments considered the freedom to cross borders as a fundamental human right. Now the emphasis of the debate is more often on the provision for people to remain in their home territory. For some countries, like Spain and Italy, migration is a relatively recent phenomenon. Only fifteen years ago, Spaniards would often emigrate to live in other countries. In recent years, there have been significant influxes of migrants from South America, North Africa, and recent European Union (EU) accession states. In a period of only five years, between 1995 and 2000, the population of migrants to Spain nearly doubled from 500,000 to 900,000. From 2001 to 2004, there has been a growth of over 850,000 legal immigrants to Spain. In 2007, 10 per cent of the Spanish population are migrants.

5. Whilst 'managed migration' is at the forefront of policy agendas, migrants are not commodities and their human rights should be respected. Migration policy tends to focus on economic implications but the notion of 'managed migration' should also

take into account the impact on developing countries, the framework of universal human rights and the relationship to humanitarian assistance.

Root Causes of Migration

6. There are many factors which affect international migration of which two of the key factors are inequality and globalisation. The marginalising effects of inequality can drive people out of their home countries and globalisation has made individuals aware of opportunities beyond their own frontiers. These dual drivers have led many to risk their lives in an attempt to improve conditions for themselves and their families. In the twelve countries that make up Western Africa, the economic situation is worse today than it was thirty years ago. In the 1980s, the Canary Islands and Senegal had economies of the same size. Today, the economies of all twelve countries in Western Africa do not equal that of Senegal in the 1980s. Meanwhile, the population of West Africa has increased from 53 to 100 million. Whilst the population of Sub-Saharan Africa has also increased, today Africa produces only a third of the economic outputs it was producing in 1983. It is inevitable that young people are looking for new horizons, resulting in possible 'brain drain'.

7. There is interdependence between economic growth, development assistance, and migration. In addressing the root causes of migration, opportunities and circumstances in the source countries need to improve in order to encourage citizens to stay. This entails increased international investment into the poorest countries, including resources for health, education, governance, technology, capacity building, training, and improved partnerships between international development institutions. Microcredit and business development assistance provided to the source countries are also helping to create opportunities, including through assisted voluntary return schemes. In Sub-Saharan Africa, for example, Italy has provided funds and collaborated on initiatives to establish development projects and in certain industrial sectors.

8. Spain is supporting the economic and infra-structural development of countries which send workers to meet the demands of the Spanish labour market. Senegal, for example, requested a school to provide professional training for people involved in the hospitality industry to further promote tourism in the country. Cape

Verde has a goal of restoring its historical heritage. Mali and Ghana are focusing on improvements to agricultural skills. These programmes, which link directly to the needs of the originating countries, also assist people to gain qualifications which are more widely recognised.

9. Information campaigns have been used in Sub-Saharan Africa and East Africa to assist people to make informed decisions about migration. Using a multi-sectoral approach, the International Organisation for Migration (IOM) has set up campaigns that target schools, print media, radio, television, police, and justice systems. Secondary school campaigns have particular benefits, but whilst students may be happy to stay in their source countries, the question remains of what they will do to make best use of their qualifications.

10. The three pillars of a comprehensive approach to address migration can be identified as follows: legal migration; illegal migration; and integration. 'Legal' migrants include asylum seekers, refugees, and economic migrants, either highly-skilled or lower-skilled. 'Illegal' migrants include victims of international human trafficking, 'overstayers', or those fleeing their home countries without legitimate claims or documentation to claim asylum. These categories of 'legal' and 'illegal' migration are very broad terms and warrant further exploration and definition. However, they can be a starting point to tackling the 'virtuous triangle': absorbing legal migration, preventing illegal migration, and facilitating integration.

Legal Migration

11. Legal migration is one of the most sensitive subjects for discussion, particularly in terms of the public debate over numbers. An institutional framework would assist to develop common policies and to ensure consistent implementation.

12. The debate over refugees has proved similarly complex in some countries but there are clear international frameworks to govern their treatment. The right to seek asylum is set out in Article 14 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees. The United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR) is mandated to ensure the protection of individuals seeking asylum from persecution. Many people in flight end up in refugee

camps, but this should not be seen as a long-term solution to the issue of protection. The Resettlement Programme is one of the components of the protection regime which attempts to address this problem. Under this scheme, some refugees in first countries of asylum have the possibility of obtaining a protection visa prior to undergoing an asylum procedure upon arrival in the receiving country. Resettlement is usually based on a national quota system, selecting the most vulnerable. Integration is a core part of the resettlement programme and should focus on the needs of the individual family, including housing, health, education, and employment.

13. Refugee procedures can be expensive, complicated, and time consuming and there are concerns that current practice does not provide consistent or adequate protection. A current UK priority is to decrease the processing time for asylum decisions and expedite the subsequent removal of people with failed claims. The Border and Immigration Agency (BIA) has recently introduced a new procedure (the New Asylum Model) for case management, with one case-worker now overseeing the end-to-end process.

14. Lawyers and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) are increasingly concerned about extraterritorial action. Article 33 of the Refugee Convention sets out that no contracting state shall expel or return a refugee to territories where his life or freedom would be threatened. This protection extends to all points of interception, including maritime intervention in international waters, but often gives rise to questions about which state is responsible for determining the asylum application. The Dublin Convention and the Dublin II Regulation were intended to streamline and clarify the process but there are differing views as to their effectiveness. There are also cases where the law of sea has been put ahead of humanitarian rescue and the arbitrary route of a boat between Africa and the Spanish coast can have a direct effect on the fate of the passengers, depending if the voyage is in territorial or international waters.

15. Currently, within the EU system, refugees have no access to legal representation unless they are physically present in the EU. It is argued that there is a need to open up the possibility for refugees to present their asylum request from their country of origin, or outside their destination or transit countries. Spain is one of

the few countries in Europe with the option to claim asylum at an embassy, but to date there have been few successful cases.

16. There are also concerns that it is becoming increasingly difficult for bona fide refugees to get to Europe to make an asylum claim and, with increasingly strengthened borders, it is unclear how refugees can get to countries to do this. Since 2002, 48 per cent of those arriving in boats to Malta have been recognised as needing some kind of protection.

17. In addition to national initiatives, the UK also supports a broader approach to asylum management and works with other states and international bodies, such as IOM, towards a comprehensive strategy. It is funding a component of UNHCR's work in Tanzania and Kenya in order to improve protection in refugees' regions of origin. The UK is working with countries such as Nigeria, in document fraud detection and capacity building projects. In 2006-2007, the UK's £8 million Migration Fund provided support to 57 projects in 32 countries, and has been successful in securing EU funding for a series of specific projects along the East African migration routes in partnership with the IOM.

Economic Migration

18. With respect to labour migration, there is no co-ordinated international approach, legal instruments, or legal framework in place to represent the concerns of the international community. The management of migration is left to national sovereign governments. However, the responsibility for external border controls is simultaneously shifting towards transnational institutions and regimes.

19. Whilst individual countries fight against illegal entry, they must also address labour market needs. The expanding job market and work opportunities offered by the Spanish economy have turned Spain into a magnet for migration. Since 1990, there has been extraordinary growth in the number of jobs: from 13 million to 20 million. Over the last five years, foreigners have taken up positions in low paid jobs that are not generally appealing to the Spanish population, for example, in the sectors of hospitality, construction, and agriculture. The arrival of these foreign

workers is viewed positively, as they have become active participants in public services. Of the 3.5 million people who hold residence permits, 2 million are making national insurance contributions and thereby contributing to the upkeep of the country. However, Spain is starting to need more qualified workers and will have to adjust its current policy to meet the change in demand.

20. The UK and Canada have both introduced a points-based migration system, in an attempt to attract the 'right' skills from around the world, matching the needs of their respective labour markets. Both systems reward qualifications, work experience and education and these countries have acknowledged that migration has brought dynamism and strength into their economies. Canada projects that by 2011, 100 per cent of its economic growth will come from immigrants. It further projects that by 2030, 100 per cent of the net population growth will come from the same source. More than 70 per cent of immigrants to Canada have completed undergraduate studies and many have graduate degrees, demonstrating that they are more skilled and educated than ever before. Yet there are still shortfalls in these migration systems and there are many challenges in aligning the human resources with occupational needs and knowledge of the labour market knowledge. For some migrants, language is still an initial barrier.

21. Some countries have established quotas for highly skilled migrants, such as Germany's for IT workers. There is potential to expand these schemes beyond the national level and to apply them internationally. Whilst they are difficult to establish, given the different sectors and needs of the business community and type of workers required, it could be possible to develop. One way forward would be for the business community to support training for areas of high need.

22. The involvement of trade unions is essential both to establish regulatory frameworks and to support the integration of migrant workers. Many trade unions also operate at the international level, working with their counterparts in other countries to discuss, for example, the equality of the labour market or the comparative merits of international qualifications. The private sector should also be included in the formulation of partnership initiatives such as good practice codes, in order to ensure widespread application. For example, whilst there is a

Commonwealth Code of Health Workers, and a clear code of practice, there are agencies in the private sector which frequently bypass these agreements.

23. A challenge for many migrants is the validation of degrees from their own countries: this often hinders their ability to find appropriate employment in the receiving country. Better cross-border degree and qualification recognition would greatly increase the opportunities for circular migration.

24. In 2005, the European Community started work on a large-scale policy plan towards a more comprehensive approach to migration. The proposals, which include contributions from government, NGOs, social partners, and churches, are still under discussion. The main objective is to establish networks and tools to ensure member states can exchange information more effectively. This will take into account the varying needs of states and, for example, could harmonise the process for intra-corporate transfers and the remuneration of trainees. By establishing a statistical framework, states will have access to better and more reliable data to gain a clearer understanding of the overall demographic picture. Currently, there is no single, all-inclusive system measuring movement into or out of some of the member states.

Irregular Migration

25. Irregular migration has recently become a serious problem for Spain, given its geographical location only 15 kilometres from the African coast. The Canary Islands are 100 kilometres from the coast of the Sahara. This proximity and the difference in the relative economies of Africa and Europe, make Spain an attractive destination. Many African migrants have embarked on dangerous trips, including routes in excess of 2000 kilometres, sometimes involving hundreds of people in a boat no longer than twelve metres. Such harsh conditions are resulting in thousands of deaths. Spain has acknowledged its responsibility to international treaties, and Spanish vessels have contributed to humanitarian efforts to save thousands of lives of people coming from Africa. The lack of legal documentation amongst many people coming from Sub-Saharan Africa poses a particular challenge to officers at the point of arrival.

26. Political and diplomatic initiatives have been used by Spain with some success to tackle illegal migration from both Morocco and Sub-Saharan Africa. These

include joint patrols of the Atlantic and Straits of Gibraltar as well as agreements with the Moroccan business community to identify regular routes enabling Moroccan workers to fill gaps in the labour market and to change the flow from illegal into legal. Prior to these efforts, 90 per cent of illegal migration to Spain had come via Morocco; after three and a half years of cooperative efforts there was a 99 per cent success rate on the return of Moroccan seasonal workers. Spain has worked more recently with Sub-Saharan African countries to build mutual confidence resulting in a 70 per cent reduction of arrivals of illegal immigrants. The Spanish strategy includes investment in training for young Africans and awareness raising campaigns to deter illegal migrants.

27. Interpol estimates that India contributes to the largest illegal population in Europe, and an estimated two million Indians cross international borders illegally every year.

28. Status is not static: migrants who arrive in a regular manner and stay beyond the length of their visas become irregular and this issue affects many countries. Most people living illegally in Italy are 'overstayers', who arrive, find a job, and work without access to social benefits. From time to time, Italy has been regularising these people, and facilitating their integration into the labour market, but not giving them an amnesty.

29. Human trafficking has now become a larger 'industry' worldwide than drug trafficking. In India alone, it is a multi-million dollar business. India is working with the Italian embassy to set up a localised initiative between a sending and receiving country to tackle trafficking. India has also worked with the British High Commission to coordinate an outreach campaign, distributing pamphlets to 146 Indian villages to inform people of their rights, employment possibilities and opportunities. In conjunction with this information campaign, tougher checks have also been introduced to crack down on traffickers.

Integration

30. There are three main dimensions of integration: economic, social, and community participation. Economic integration could be measured by employment

data or salary levels. Social integration can be measured by knowledge of the local language, access to housing, and school attendance. Participation might include degrees of political engagement, such as access to, or involvement in local elections, provision for obtaining citizenship or dual citizenship, or volunteering levels in the local community. The experience of second-generation immigrants can provide a benchmark for integration. This second generation may also provide an important bridge between the country of origin and the host society.

31. There is no one strategy for successful integration, given that each migrant community has different needs and demands. Economic migrants may plan a temporary stay, whereas refugees may not have the freedom to return safely to their countries of origin. Nor it is necessary for the EU to develop a common integration model to be used by all member states, given that they have different needs. The EU has developed a platform for the exchange of best practices, which includes handbooks, regular meetings, and a yearly ministerial conference. In 2008, the European Commission will be launching an integration website to be accessed by third parties.

32. Integration requires a general strengthening of public services, including support in the educational system, housing, medical services, and language learning. Housing, in particular, is a core component. In the UK, housing is a significant challenge given the limited supply of public sector housing. New migrants are often accommodated in private rented housing, and many share accommodation to the point where overcrowding and environmental health issues are a concern. Language is one of the main keys to integration and also one of the greatest barriers: the lack of consistent language training and support is a serious obstacle in many EU countries.

33. From the perspective of the migrant, the integration process often begins before the departure, in pro-actively seeking employment or learning the local language of the destination country. From a policy perspective, many countries work from the premise that integration starts upon arrival. In the UK, it has been found that many migrants initially rely on their friends and contacts, rather than public agencies. Initially, migrants lack good reliable information about cultures, norms and what can be expected, both of them and from the host country.

34. Family integration is an important component and, when carried out well, has been found to facilitate the long term integration process. There is now a EU directive providing some limited scope for family re-unification, however the definition of family is narrow and does not take full account of the cultural norms of some migrant groups.

35. Whilst individual country strategies vary according to their own context, most integration models take a multi-sectoral approach, recognising the importance of involving the different infrastructures of society, including religion, culture, and the economy. Wide participation and co-operation are essential, including at local, regional, and national levels of government, trade unions, corporate leadership, universities, assessment services, churches, medical services, and schools.

36. Spain has recently created a new directorate to design a coherent strategic plan for integration, reflecting upon the experiences of France, the UK, the Netherlands, and the lessons learned from these models. The competencies of the Spanish state are distributed across each level of government: local, regional and state level. There is an over-arching political framework for cooperation at the regional level, which is responsible for education, health, and housing. A budget of 2 billion Euros has been allocated for 2007-2010 to support the different levels of government, NGOs, and other associations in implementation of the plan. The underpinning principles include: fulfilling the rights, duties, and obligations to migrants; facilitating the civil participations of immigrants; and respecting their intercultural nature and needs, religious diversity, and fundamental liberties.

37. The Portuguese model includes a national centre for immigrant support, along with an action plan to support the integration of migrants. This includes the direct involvement of immigrants and immigrant associations in implementation of the plan, with the ultimate objective of providing migrants with the same access to public services as is afforded to the host community.

Remittances

39. Globally, remittances are estimated to be equivalent to three times development aid, including money transfers between north-south and south-south. Remittances back to Africa now exceed foreign investment in the region. As an example, 70 per cent of the GNP of Senegal comes from remittances. The diaspora communities are playing an important role in the development of their home countries. On the negative side of the coin, there is concern that some money sent through 'informal' banking systems is being laundered into European banks and real estate.

40. Further cooperation with third countries with respect to remittances could greatly enhance circular migration and mobility partnerships. For example, mobility and access could be discussed in conjunction with dialogue over remittance transfer and investment back into the country of origin. Such schemes require further discussion and fully co-operative efforts.

Border Control and Security

41. Members of the European Union already co-operate on shared mechanisms within borders such as Eurodac, (a European Union-wide electronic system for the identification of asylum-seekers and illegal immigrants) or the Schengen Information System, which collectively strengthen security. Increasingly, work is turning towards further co-operation with third countries.

42. Frontiers are recognised as part of a state's sovereignty, but the state also has the duty to ensure that sovereign rights are in line with their obligations in respect of international conventions. For example, if the naval vessel of a contracting state is operating in international waters, that state is accountable for what happens on the boat.

43. FrontEx (or *Frontières Extérieures*) is an independent European agency funded by the EU and individual member states and headquartered in Warsaw. It was created in 2005 just after the most recent EU enlargement involving the accession of ten new member states. The agency aims to coordinate the operational co-operation between Member States in their management of external borders: the responsibility for control of border surveillance and management remains a sovereign

issue. Its main objective is to ensure better control and management of the external borders of the EU, involving the member states as appropriate to a particular operation, for example, land, air, and sea borders (the latter being the most complex) Since its inception, it has mounted forty joint operations at external borders. This has included decisive cooperation with Senegal. Additionally, FrontEx provides a unit to train EU border guards, including Rapid Border Intervention Teams (RABITS).

44. Governments of sending countries and those which host transit migrants, including in North Africa and on the coast of West Africa, are keen to work with the EU and its member states. They are increasingly recognising that migration management includes the creation of jobs and strong institutions of government, in addition to border management and ensuring systems of legal entry. Resources to control borders or issue documentation are relatively scarce, which means that many governments have limited capacity to exercise authority over their borders. Niger and Mali (the two last countries on the UN's human development index), in addition to Mauritania, have borders that are too large to police with their current resources.

International Co-operation

45. Greater policy coherence between the development and migration agendas can be achieved through 'co-operation platforms'. These incorporate principles about country-led activity and sustainable, measurable interventions, which have been designated to include a broad range of economic and civil society activity. Migration partnerships have the potential to enable partners to raise all issues of concern, ranging from increased labour migration and remittances to assistance to return illegal migrants and build the capacity overseas. The involvement of Sub-Saharan African, North African, and Arab countries is important in developing solutions with shared responsibility. This can be achieved through both bilateral and multilateral initiatives, such as the EU's work with the African Union.

46. The development of common policy requires intergovernmental cooperation and multi-national institutional frameworks including mechanisms for information exchange, sharing best practice, and financial solidarity.

Conclusions

47. Countries and international organisations should engage in a rights-based rather than purely economic-based discourse, addressing both what migrants and states want and need. History provides some important lessons: movement within and across the 53 countries of the British Commonwealth can be seen in the development of a broader culture and tradition. For example, many Commonwealth immigrants are integrated into UK society in economic, cultural, and linguistic terms.

48. There are some underlying assumptions in the migration discourse that are worthy of review and reconsideration. Migration can be seen as a continuum, rather than a strict categorisation of illegal, irregular, legal, highly skilled, refugees, and asylum seekers. There is a fundamental difference between people who are willing to leave their countries and people who are compelled to leave because of threats to their being. One individual might be categorised in different ways and the relationship between illegal and legal migration could be further explored. However it is important that legal definitions are not confused.

49. Migration and integration policy is still largely addressed at the national level within Europe, based on the different labour requirements and social contracts within each country. There is, however, potential for better information exchange and sharing of best practice which could encourage countries to develop more co-ordinated national policies. This same consistency should be applied to illegal migration leading to a more integrated approach to border management including the application of human rights law. As an integral part of common economic and security policy, migration can usefully be addressed in terms of foreign policy.

50. The next Global Forum on Migration, to be hosted by the Philippines, presents an opportunity to build upon the 2006 Brussels meeting, to support further dialogues, and showcase best practices with respect to migration, but also other issues that are closely interlinked with migration.

51. European migration policy is currently driven by the recognition that countries need this mobility to sustain their work-forces. Spain is an example of a country which, in recent decades, has boosted its economy through recognition of the

importance of migrant workers. However, migration flows need to be monitored and this requires further cooperation between and among European and third countries. Migration also has important social and cultural consequences, which force countries to evaluate their current strategies with regard to integration, access to public services and human rights.

52. Public opinion on migration varies widely and in many countries it is the subject of strong debate from all parts of the spectrum. Effective management of migration should go beyond short-term politicised responses to the current public debate and should be more strategic and evidence based. This would involve effective political leadership and planning for the long-term based on forecasts and proper assessments of the needs of the labour market and society. The media is often responsible for public perceptions and stereotypes of immigrants and these can impact negatively on the integration process for migrant communities. Strong political leadership and a responsible media could do much to steer public thinking in a positive way. For example, the portrayal of the manner in which people arrive can influence attitudes and assumptions about migrants. Migrants and refugees are not commodities; they are people with varying skills and ambitions and should be dealt with sensitively and fairly in accordance with national legislation and international obligations.

Kimberley Ochs

7 November 2007

Wilton Park Reports are brief summaries of the main points and conclusions of a conference. The reports reflect rapporteurs' personal interpretations of the proceedings – as such they do not constitute any institutional policy of Wilton Park nor do they necessarily represent the views of rapporteurs.